



RIGHT OF DEFENCE

№ 12 (OCTOBER - DECEMBER) 2017

The quarterly electronic newsletter dedicated to the situation in Kazakhstan in relation to those who defends the rights of other members of society.

Overview

Legislative Initiatives

Positive examples

Criminal prisoners and persecuted for political motivations cases

Incidents with human rights and civil society activists, organisations and media in october - december 2017

S CONTENT L. 0 Ш

OVERVIEW



unpleasant events included Kazakhstan. These tough remarks by Kyrgyzstan's President Almazbek Atambavev about Nursultan Nazarbayev that provoked a diplomatic scandal and grew into an economic war between the two neighbouring countries. Strikes at the mines of. first, a copper producing plant and then a metallurgical plant that the resulted in strikers' claims were satisfied in full in the former case and partially in the latter. Another bank supported by the National Bank of Kazakhstan has collapsed. Finally, a great deal of Kazakhstan's National Samruk Fund's money and Kazyna's assets were frozen in the U.S. after a claim from Moldovian businesspeople.

The end of 2017 marked some unpleasant events for Kazakh authorities from pursuing Kazakhstan. These included tough remarks by Kyrgyzstan's President Almazbek Atambayev about Nursultan Nazarbayev that provoked a diplomatic scandal and grew into an economic war between the two paidshouring their war against Ablyazov.

While this political emigrant who is staying in France is understandably inaccessible for Astana, the blows are targeted on those he had cooperated with or simply sympathised with him. Officials and their puppet media, bloggers and trolls make every attempt to demonise Ablyazov in the eyes of foreign countries and domestically, but to no avail.



The estimates the nation's total fiscal Kashagan deficit at KZT 1.5 trillion (ca. EUR optimisation programme. 4 billion). The October fuel crisis restructuring strategy envisions stirred people and resulted in the staff displacement of the vice minister employees. Unofficial of energy Asset Magauov. The suggests that up to 500 people of minister Bozumbayev reported cuts in oil production: the planned daily The media informed that in 2017 outputs at the Kashagan field Kazakhstan ranked 57th among located in the northern part of 137 countries in the Kazakhstan's Caspian Sea were reduced by Competitiveness Index. The year 120,000 barrels, from 370,000 to before, it was at the 53rd position 250,000, until the end of 2017. At on the list and in 2015 the 42nd. the same time, the North Caspian In the World Bank's Operating Company (comprising Business KazMunaiGas, CNPC, Inpex, ranked 65th, down Total. Shell.

Ministry of Finance ExxonMobil) that is developing announced an The reduction by 200 data energy Kanat will be dismissed.

> World sector of the Economic Forum's Global index, Kazakhstan seven ENI, and notches year-on-year.



29 November. miners claims the liquidation of mobile teams, and the Shakhtinsk and the home. The categories of plant workers.

On 15 December, a strike of coal association ArcelorMittal Temirtau near the town Shakhtinsk supported the strikers.

at of Shakhtinsk ended. The protesters Kazakhmys (copper producer) struck were promised to have the salaries of in Jezkazgan District of Karaganda those working underground raised by Oblast. Over 300 people refused to 30% from 1 January 2018 (their initial come to the surface after their shift claim was to double the wages) and had completed and submitted their an annual bonus in the amount of the company's salary. A reconciliation committee will management. The workers' claims to revise salaries for ground workers. the copper giant included a 70% The prosecutor of Shakhtinsk salary increase, the re-calculation of guaranteed that the strikers would not pensions, free treatment at health be held liable under the Criminal resorts, the return of buildings into Code. Up to 700 workers took part in corporation's ownership, the the strike. On 14 December, the Court arrangement of training at colleges ArcelorMittal's claim to suspend the meeting with the strike and declare it illegal. The corporation's CEO Eduard Ogai. By defendants in the case included the the midnight of 30 November, after strikers themselves and two trade lengthy negotiations and disputes, unions, Korgau and Zhaktau. A day most of the striking miners went earlier, however, the miners stated confrontation cooled about their mistrust in the Korgau down when Kazakhmys' managers trade union and its chair Marat declared they would raise salaries by Mirgayazov and requested that their KZT 100,000 (ca. EUR 250) for all interests be represented by the head of the Shakhtyorskaya Semya (Miners' Family) civil society Natalva Tomilova. miners at the metallurgical giant Remarkably, almost all residents of Several stars of Kazakhstan's show of the retirement age for oil workers, business expressed their support for an increase in the annual leave, the miners.

Oil workers at China-owned CNPC to have expressed their solidarity with KazMinerals, another

improvements in working conditions. and other social benefits.

Aktobemunaigas were also reported By the very end of 2017, miners at Karaganda's miners and claimed a producer in East Kazakhstan Oblast, 100% salary increase, the reduction also demanded an increase in wages.



The unpleasant statements by the leaving Kyrgyz President Almazbek Atambayev about Nursultan Nazarbayev resulted in the taking of diplomatic measures by Kazakhstan but then led to crowds at the Kazakh-Kyrgyz border - it is evident that Kazakhstan's border officers were instructed to create artificial queues. Then the import of foodstuffs from Kyrgyzstan was prohibited and, ultimately, Kyrgyzstan announced its possible withdrawal from the Eurasian Economic Union (EAEU). At the same time, Astana claimed that Kyrgyzstan had violated the rules of trade within the EAEU by re-exporting Chinese goods to the Union's countries, in response to Kyrgyzstan's denunciation of the agreement with Kazakhstan for a US \$100 million financial assistance from the latter to fulfil the roadmaps of Kyrgyzstan's accession to the EAEU.

On 19 December, the United Nations General Assembly adopted Ukraine's resolution on the "Situation of Human Rights in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the City of Sevastopol," by a vote of 70 in favour to 26 against (including Kazakhstan), with 76 abstentions.

LEGISLATIVE INITIATIVES

The draft law On Amending and Republic of Kazakhstan. It sets out Supplementing Certain Statutes of more precisely some provisions of Kazakhstan the constitutional laws concerning Republic of Regarding Religious Activities and the judicial system, the placement of Religious Associations that had the state symbols, and the work of concern with religious the Constitutional Council and the rights Astana International and human communities activists has been most probably Centre. postponed until the next year. In the meantime. the suggested By the end of the year, on 28 amendments are being advertised December, President Nazarbayev among the "beneficiaries" of the signed amendments to the laws on

even stronger.

instrument.

approved amendments concerning the upgrade of the fundamental lawenforcement procedure. The law can be divided into two parts. The first The law also introduces the term of solidifies protection of human rights, while the second aims to streamline the procedure.

December, Nazarbayev signed Amendina and Certain Constitutional Laws of the definitions.

information and communications. These amendments complicate the President Nazarbayev signed procedure and extend the period for Decree 579, On Certain Issues of responding to journalists' enquiries State Secrets of the by two and a half times, contrary to Republic of Kazakhstan, which the recommendations of authoritative transfers the functions and powers international organisations. In fact, relating to the protection of state the law obliges the owners of the of the Republic of websites where users can post Kazakhstan from the Government's information (forums, social networks, Chancellery to the National Security comments on the news, etc.) to Committee. Experts believe this will censor such posts and take part in make Karim Massimov's influence investigative work that involves the use of telecommunication networks. The equipment of such websites with On 7 December, the Senate instruments and software for the

identification of users will inevitably

businesses working in this sphere.

"information prejudicing

serious burden

place a

interests," without providing any legal grounds for this. In addition, it obliges journalists to obtain consent President to the distribution of personal and the Law On family secrets, although these terms Supplementing are not given accurate

POSITIVE EXAMPLES



Teimur Akhmedov, one of Astana Jehovah's Witnesses. In it, the Akhmedov to five years in prison. international authority calls the Kazakh government to free the On 15 follower of the religious Taichibekov, a blogger, organisation Kazakhstan refused to accept prison. Taichibekov the petition to revise Akhedov's sentenced

On 2 October, the Working Group 2017, Akhmedov was arrested by Arbitrary Detention of the the National Security Committee Office of the United Nations High for expressing his religious beliefs Commissioner for Human Rights and charged under Article 174 of published its opinion concerning the Criminal Code (instigation of the detention and imprisonment of religious hatred). On 2 May, the Court sentenced

October. Yermek immediately, released on parole having spent However, the Supreme Court of two years and one month in to case, which was filed based on imprisonment under Article 174 of the Decision of the United the Criminal Code (instigation of Nations Working Group on religious hatred) for his Facebook Arbitrary Detention. In January posts where he wrote about his dream that Kazakhstan and Chelakh concerning the violation Eurasian state.

Kapchagai Town the Oblast) to of Union the KazTAG Rights. of information agency, were arrested on 22 February 2016. They were On 12 December, the European charged with fraudulent dealings Parliament ratified the Enhanced for a total of over KZT 300 million Partnership and Cooperation with Information Committee Investment and Development of two years ago. The agreement Kazakhstan and Kazakhtelecom, covers 29 areas of cooperation, and tax evasion in the amount of from economy and KZT 300 million. The court passed countering the spread of weapons its judgement concerning Seitkazy of mass destruction and terrorism, and Aset Matayevs on 3 October, as well as cooperation in the area sentencing them to six and five of climate change, healthcare, years in prison respectively, with public finance and taxation. The the seizure of illegally acquired European Parliament's resolution The appellate court contains upheld the first judgement.

Nations Committee for Human specific cases. Rights made its decision on the complaint by the soldier Vladislav

Russia would reunite as a single of his right to fair trial. Chelakh had been charged with having shot his 14 comrades On 4 December, the resolution of ranger and destroyed service and Court household facilities at Arkanrelease Kergen, Kazakhstan's temporary Seitkazy Matayev, chairman of the border post, on 28 May 2012. On Journalists of 11 December 2012, Chelakh was Kazakhstan, on parole took effect. declared guilty of the crimes and The president of the National sentenced to life imprisonment. Press Club Seitkazy Matayev and The complaint was prepared and his son Asset Matayev, general filed by the Bureau for Human

Communications, Agreement between Kazakhstan and Informatisation and the EU, by a majority of votes. of the Ministry of The sides signed the document many requirements related to ensuring compliance with human rights, including the On 13 November 2017, the United requirement to take measures in

RENEWAL OF THE CASES OF POLITICAL PRISONERS AND POLLITICALLY OPPRESSED PERSONS



Tolepkali Ayanov, Talgat Ayan and Max Bokayev's lawyer, stated that it had taken three days to consider appeals from the two activists. After the Appellate Board of the Atyrau Oblast Court upheld Bokayev and Ayan's sentences on 20 January 2017, the lawyer filed three cassation appeals. However, his petitions to the Cassation Board of the Supreme Court of Kazakhstan, in which he requested to shorten the sentences, were not considered. According to the lawyer, the judge at the trial court had said it openly that the case was a political one. In August, Talgat Ayan was transferred to Colony K-168/2 in Aktobe and Bokayev remained at the Petropavlovsk Colony, although the law requires that they serve their sentences in a colony in Atyrau Oblast, of which they are residents.

Max Bokayev and Talgat Ayanov (Ayan), civil society activists from Atyrau, were judged to five years in prison in November 2016. They were found guilty of having violated three articles of the Criminal Code of Kazakhstan: inciting social hatred, organising an unauthorised rally, and distributing knowingly false information. Both activists denied their guilt. The proceedings involved multiple violations of law. Several human rights organisations, the U.S. Embassy in Kazakhstan and the EU delegation asked to free Bokayev and Ayanov. Amnesty International declared them political prisoners.



Olga Koltunova, Vadim Kuramshin's mother, reported that the High-Security Penal Colony in the settlement of Gorny, North Kazakhstan Oblast, where her son was serving his sentence, would soon be closed. She was concerned that Vadim was to be sent to a colony in Ust-Kamenogorsk as envisioned by the colony's reorganisation scheme. Koltunova believed that Kuramshin would be in danger at the new facility because before his arrest he had repeatedly criticised the managers of this colony and alleged they had tortured the prisoners. She also complained that if Kuramshin was transferred to Ust-Kamenogorsk, it would be difficult for her to visit him. The transfer was scheduled on 10 December. Vadim Kuramshin was transferred to that colony in late December.

On 7 December 2012, Vadim Kuramshin was judged to twelve years in high-security prison after having been found guilty of blackmailing an assistant of a district prosecutor. Kuramshin was arrested in connection with these charges soon after he had returned from an OSCE conference in September 2012 where he talked about violations of human rights in Kazakhstan. The first jury declared Kuramshin not guilty of most of the charges, but then the jury members were replaced.

Incidents with human rights activists, public organizations, independent media as of October to December, 2017

Akhmet,

HUMAN RIGHTS AND CIVIL SOCIETY ACTIVISTS, **BLOGGERS**

29 September 2017, SHYMKENT. Kazakhstan, was detained the sentence for Larisa Kharkova, minor son former chair of the Confederation of explained authority and condemned to four Akhmet was vears of restraint with confiscation of property.

October 2017, ASTANA. country, 10 to condemned price increases" on 1 October at the November, the Kiev Baiterek Monument in Astana. That Court released Zhanar Akhmet on

October 2017 day he prepared several posters for the protest and went out to go to the monument or elsewhere.

21 October 2017, KIEV. Zhanara

а

blogger

near

The oblast court of appeal upheld Kiev where she had fled with her this spring. Akhmet her escape Independent Trade Unions of political prosecution in Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan that had been closed In the evening, two men came to by the authorities. The lower court her, drew her from the apartment condemned Kharkova to the she lived in and did not let her confiscation of property, four years back. Akhmet called to the police of restraint, 100 hours of monthly and her lawyer. Then the men tried forced labour and a five-year to detain her by force. After the prohibition to hold any positions police arrived, they went away. society or non- Zhanara Akhmet was detained for governmental organisations. On 25 72 hours and placed in a pre-trial July 2017, Larisa Kharkova was detention facility. The court later found guilty of having abused her decided on her extradition arrest. detained at the request of the Prosecutor General's Office Republic of the Kazakhstan. fleeina Before she had been under Muratbek Argynbekov was found probationary supervision after she guilty of having infringed the had been released on parole from a procedure for holding a rally and prison where she had served her days of criminal sentence. On 18 October administrative arrest for an alleged 2017, Ukraine's Migration Service attempt to organise a protest. In refused to grant Akhmet asylum. one of his Facebook posts, he However, she was not informed called people to gather for a rally about this decision and, therefore, "on the issues of the land law and could not appeal against it. On 22 Svetlana Zalischuk.

An unknown man attacked Marat Association of Lawyers submit the Zhanuzakov, an opposition and list of participants in the convention. human rights activist, when he walked to his office in the morning. 25 October 2017, The attacker hit Zhanuzakov on the Bauyrzhan Azanov, a lawyer, was head so that he lost consciousness approached by three unknown, and fell to the ground. There were heavily built young men wearing spots of blood on the pavement. sports clothes with hoods in the When Zhanuzakov recovered street. They took Azanov by the consciousness, he went to a police elbows and demanded that he stop station and made a report. The "persecuting" the police officers police initiated pre-trial proceedings Tukenov and Medetov who had under the charge of disorderly attacked the lawyer in court conduct. Marat Zhanuzakov is a premises back in 2015, handcuffed member of the of committee (Freedom) Prize awarded since criminal charges then and, over the democracy and civil society in allow the police to terminate the Kazakhstan. In 2002, he headed an case. oblast division of the opposition party Democratic Choice Kazakhstan (DVK) and then a division of Alga, an unregistered opposition party. In 2012, this party was prohibited in Kazakhstan by court.

LAWYERS

Shagatayev, deputy chair of the slandered Nurlan Lawyers in Uralsk, stated that the discredited his

bail put up by the parliamentarian October where they wanted to protest against the proposed Law on Lawyers. The National Security 29 October 2017, KOKSHETAU. Committee demanded that

> ASTANA. organisational him and manhandled him for an the Svoboda hour. Azanov had managed to bring people who promote entire period that followed, did not

November 2017

HUMAN RIGHTS AND CIVIL SOCIETY ACTIVISTS, **BLOGGERS**

November 2017, ASTANA. Saryarka District Court 2 in Astana declared Aidyn Yegeubayev, a civil 6 October 2017, URALSK. Ruslan society activist, guilty of having Bivaldilov. West Kazakhstan Association of founder of the Batua company, and business association lawyers intended to sentenced him to two years of take part in the All-Kazakhstan restraint and the payment of moral Convention of Lawyers on 14 damages totalling KZT 100,000 (ca.

EUR 250). Judge Bolat Pazylov non-official group of Facebook dismissed Biyaldilov's claim for users who gathered in a park near financial damages worth KZT 87 the monument of Mahatma Gandhi million (ca. EUR 230,000). The to discuss political and social claim was a result of several issues. In the video they had of them were allegedly prepared, three people in Two Newtimes.kz website and the DAT join armed jihad newspaper that had published government. The Yegeubayev China's citizens among founders.

planned, under the guise of an telecommunication the police stated to the media that, presumably a and had already prepared a video should do. statement calling for armed jihad."

permission to hold a sanctioned Saryarka Court rally on social issues. One of the declared Makhambet Abzhan, detained

associated with the media, the masks called their countrymen to against the video was articles with Yegeubayev's words attributed to the detained group of that, "China has already taken persons because the faces of the possession of Kazakhstan's land." speakers can be seen in one of the made a cuts. Then three people in masks YouTube post where he had appear under the flag of Hizb utallegedly stated that Batua had Tahrir, an organisation that had its been prohibited in Kazakhstan but had been unpopular for a long time already. Out of the four arrested 27 November 2017, ALMATY. Six persons, Almat Zhumagulov and people were detained several days Kenzhebek Abishev's arrests were before the First President's Day. extended. They were charged with Four of them were arrested having propagated terrorism with According to investigators, they had the use of the mass media or unregistered civil society Notably, Abishev did not appear in organisation, activities to disturb the the video. The others are on public order, intimidate the public recognisance. The lawyers of the and sabotage the work of law- arrested persons provided a video enforcement bodies. The next day where one of the participants, National Security "the detained persons had planned Committee's officer, gives them to distribute propaganda materials fake guns and explains what they

However, earlier they had applied 27 November 2017, ASTANA. to the akimat (mayor's office) for Judge Birzhan Toregeldy at 2 in persons, Almat human rights activist, guilty of Zhumagulov, was a member of a having committed sizeable fraud

and condemned him to three and a the police officers. half years in prison with the seizure court concluded that Abzhan and Police officers former friend Zhetpibavev had Galvmzhan Panov development company. The latter events in the country in apartment. begin construction. to complainant had Zhetpitbayev and Abzhan of fraud. she would be jailed. In Notably, the period for constructing November, that time, and Abzhan had returned with her child. the complainant his money. Then, however, Zhetpibayev had accused Abzhan of having received USD assisted troubled detained and administrative arrests beaten by police officers for the during its foundation, alleged tear of a pocket of one of "unlawful

of "illegally acquired" property. The 29 November 2017, KYZYLORDA. burst into Azamat apartment of Khadisha deceived Akhmetzhan, an activist who had by having held a stand-alone picketing a week proposed him to buy an apartment before requiring that President at the Atakent residential estate to Nazarbayev reside. She has also be constructed by Zhetpibayev's been criticising social and political was a complainant in the case. Facebook posts for several months. According to investigators, Abzhan The police officers wanted to make had persuaded Panov to pay an an administrative record and then instalment of KZT 1 million (ca. detain Akhmetzhan. They were EUR 2,500) for the purchase of the stopped by the fact that she, being However, since a single mother, had a disabled Zhetpibayev's company had failed child. Later, Akhmethzan reported the that she had received telephone accused calls with threats and promises that unable to resist the estate had not completed yet at pressure, she fled to Kyrgyzstan

CIVIL SOCIETY ASSOCIATIONS

8,000 from him. The head of 17 November 2017, ASTANA. The Shanyrak, a republican civil society Specialised Interdistrict Economic association, is known for having Court of Astana had a preliminary debtors and (and final) hearing of the case filed residents of Astana whose property by Astana's Yesil District State had been seized for "government Revenue Department against the needs." He also initiated a number Alash Zholy republican civil society of protests and was arbitrarily association. The claimant required sentenced to that the court invalidate Alash several Zholy's registration as a legal entity times. In 2016, he was condemned because of the "irreparable" restraint after having been infringements of the law committed involvement of participants during registration of force the family from it. An officer of do with the registration of the things from government's plans to lease land to officer, but foreigners.

HUMAN RIGHTS AND CIVIL SOCIETY ACTIVISTS, BLOGGERS

Court in Almaty considered the police officer and Committee for Human Rights, and the Law termination of proceedings. The court took into officer. used an in

the civil society association." The the district police department was reason for the claim was that two among the group. After Telibekov out of the eleven participants on the called the police patrol, the invaders list stated that they had nothing to run away. They took some valuable the organisation. Alash Zholy was set Telibekov reported the incident to up in April 2016 to counter the the police, mentioning the police instead of investigation he was imposed a substantial penalty for December 2017 signed his report as "the chair of the Union of Muslims of Kazakhstan," while the police officers stated that he should have signed it as stated in the registration documents - the 6 December 2017, ALMATY. Judge Union of Muslims of Kazakhstan Kaparova at the Bostandyk District civil society foundation. The same against claim concerning the dispossession Telibekov had made his report was of the family of Murat Telibekov, in charge of the administrative head of the Union of Muslims of proceedings. The court imposed a the Muslim fine on Telibekov for having violated Civil on the Associations.

account that the case had been 11 December 2017, KARAGANDA. heard earlier and there was a valid The Appellate Board upheld the judgement on it that dismissed the sentence for Sanat Bukenov, a claims against the Telibekov family. lawyer from Balkhash, who had An important fact was that a minor accused a number of officials from was to be deprived of the only his town of corruption. Bukenov was housing if the case were satisfied. A arrested in late June 2016 and group of fraudsters, including a sentenced to four years in prison for counterfeit a "knowingly false report" against attempt to representatives of government and dispossess the Telibekov family of law-enforcement bodies on 2 March their apartment they had lived in for 2017. There were a total of nine over twenty years. The first time complainants who had held various they came to Telibekov's apartment government offices when "insulted" without any documents and tried to by Bukenov. This figure is explained

prosecution of а refused who had distribution of property intended for police. orphans.

Bakhytzhan Toregozhina, head of Shakhtyorskaya Ar.Rukh.Khak human political asylum obtained listening device in a napkin holder have taken no with her. The at the Bureau for Human Rights' miners, made a where centre bloggers snatched the device from then withdrew it.

by the fact that the lawyer was Toregozhina and tried to run away. involved in two cases at the same He was assisted by three or four alleged malicious other men. The man was caught at resident of the stairs and the device was taken Balkhash for the possession of away from him, but he and other drugs, and an official of the town men managed to escape. A report to was made to the prosecutor's office, participate in machinations with the which was later redirected to the

28 December 2017, SHAKHTINSK. 20-21 December 2017, ALMATY. Natalya Tomilova, chair of the Semva (Miners' rights Family) organisation, reported that organisation, met with the parents she and Dmitry Sinyavsky, head of of Iskander Yerimbetov, an arrested the branch of the Professional businessman, who is being forced Union of Workers of the Fuel and by the National Security Committee Energy Sector, were summoned to to persuade his sister, who had a police department. The police in intended to produce a report on Belgium, return to the country disorderly conduct. Tomilova was Yerimbetov's sister was previously detained on 14 December near the a lawyer at BTA Bank headed by Kazakhstanskaya mine where she Mukhtar Ablyazov who is currently a had come to meet the striking political opponent of President miners who had expressed mistrust Nazarbayev. Toregozhina helps to in their trade union. She felt unwell ensure media coverage of the case after the detention and was taken to of Yerimbetov who is being tortured a hospital. The report was made by and pressured at the pre-trial the mine's security guards and the facility. During the meeting in a police qualified Tomilova's actions café, Toregozhina found a covert as minor misconduct. The police action on the table they sat at and took it Tomilova since then, however. In next day she addition, Marat Mirgayazov, chair of participated in a press conference the Korgau trade union of coal report against she Tomilova, Sinyavsky demonstrated the device. After the Kozhabekov, another member of meeting ended, one of the men who the Professional Union of Workers were present at the conference as of the Fuel and Energy Sector, but

This bulletin was prepared by Kazakhstan International bureau for human rights with the support of Netherlands Helsinki Committee in fame of the project «Support human rights defenders in post-Soviet countries»

Contacts:

423 Suite, 4A, microdistrict 8, 050035, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan

Tel/Fax: +7 (727) 249 59 62; +7 (727) 249 60 44 (legal department)

Site: www.bureau.kz/en/ E-mail: grindelson@gmail.com